

## **MARICOPA COUNTY COMMISSION ON TRIAL COURT APPOINTMENTS**

### **MINUTES**

**June 1, 2020**

**PRESENT via ZOOM:** Justice Clint Bolick, Chair; Barry Aarons; Jason Barraza; Shawn Cox; Jessica Everett-Garcia; Leonard Gilroy; Walt Opaska; Steve Perica; Amanda Reeve; Paul Senseman and Stephen Silverman.

**ABSENT:** Peggy Baze

Justice Clint Bolick called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m.

#### **Introductions**

Justice Bolick introduced himself, welcomed the Commission members and the public present. He thanked everyone for their flexibility during the last-minute changes to hold the meeting by video. He mentioned that the candidates were contacted early that morning to explain the changes and were given the information to hold their interviews via Zoom.

Justice Bolick explained the purpose of the meeting is to interview for the position created by the retirement of Judge George Foster.

#### **Public Comment**

Justice Bolick asked for public comment on the candidates that will be interviewed for the Maricopa County vacancy. He reminded the speakers that they are limited to two minutes each and asked them not to repeat comments by previous speakers about the same candidate.

Lisa Sukenic spoke on behalf of Monica Bellapravalu Edelstein.  
Jessica Sanchez spoke on behalf of Ashley Villaverde Halvorson.  
Michelle Carson spoke on behalf of Julie Mata.

#### **Approval of Minutes**

Justice Bolick asked if any member wished to submit changes or additions to the draft minutes of the April 27, 2020 screening meeting. It was moved that the minutes be approved as submitted. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

#### **Disqualifications and Disclosures**

Justice Bolick asked the Commission if there were additional disqualifications or disclosures since the screening meeting on April 27, pursuant to the Commission's rules regarding conflict of interest of bias.

Jason Barraza disclosed that he recently discovered that his wife attended high school and is social media friends with Monica Bellapravalu Edelstein.

### **Due Diligence Reports**

Commission members took turns to discuss the due diligence reports for all candidates in order of interviews.

### **Candidate Interviews**

From 10:00 a.m. to 12:06 p.m. the Commission Sigmund Popko, Ashley Villaverde Halvorson, David McDowell, Rusty Crandell, Max-Henri Covil and Glenn Allen.

The Commission recessed for lunch at 12:06 p.m.

Justice Bolick called the meeting back to order at 12:33 p.m.

### **Candidate Interviews**

From 12:38 p.m. to 2:24 p.m. the Commission interviewed Francisca Cota, Julie Mata, David Garbarino, Andrew Russell, Aryeh Schwartz and Joshua Davidson.

Break at 2:24 p.m.

From 2:38 p.m. to 4:33 p.m. the Commission interviewed Monica Bellapralu Edelstein, Julie LaFave, Stasy Click, Ann Hobart and Paula Eaton.

### **Discussion of Applicants and Interviews and Selection of Nominees**

Justice Bolick reminded the Commission of the constitutionally required balance of political affiliations among nominees. He explained he would only vote on a candidate in the event of a tie.

The Commission discussed the interviews and the qualifications of the candidates in order of interviews. Justice Bolick suggested that a non-binding straw vote would be helpful to focus discussion and determine if any strong consensus existed on the potential nomination list. The results of the straw vote were:

Glenn Allen – 7  
Monica Bellapralu Edelstein - 10  
Stasy Click – 8  
Francisca Cota – 6  
Max-Henri Covil – 9  
Rusty Crandell – 7  
Joshua Davidson – 3  
Paula Eaton - 4  
David Garbarino – 5  
Ann Hobart – 4  
Julie LaFave – 8  
Julie Mata – 8  
David McDowell – 8  
Sigmund Popko – 10  
Andrew Russell – 10  
Aryeh Schwartz – 10

Ashley Villaverde Halvorson – 5

After discussion of the straw vote, Justice Bolick opened the floor for individual nominations to a non-binding list of nominees to be sent to the Governor.

Stephen Silverman moved to add Ashley Villaverde Halvorson to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 6-4-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add Aryeh Schwartz to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 10-0-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Steve Perica moved to add Glenn Allen to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 8-2-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Leonard Gilroy moved to add Francisca Cota to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 6-4-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add Monica Bellapralu Edelstein to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 10-0-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Leonard Gilroy moved to add Max-Henri Covil to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 9-1-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Shawn Cox moved to add Rusty Crandell to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 8-2-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Steve Perica moved to add Paula Eaton to the list. The motion failed by a vote of 3-7-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Stephen Silverman moved to add Sigmund Popko to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by 10-0-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Stephen Silverman moved to add David McDowell to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 9-1-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Steve Perica moved to add Julie LaFave to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 10-0-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add Andrew Russell to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 10-0-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Stephen Silverman moved to add Stasy Click to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 7-3-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Amanda Reeve moved to add Julie Mata to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 9-1-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to add David Garbarino to the list. The motion was seconded and passed by a vote of 6-4-1 with Justice Bolick abstaining.

Barry Aarons moved to close nominations and finalize the tentative list of all who received 6 or more votes. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.

The tentative list consisting of **Glenn Allen, Monica Bellapravalu Edelstein, Stasy Click, Francisca Cota, Max-Henri Covil, Rusty Crandell, David Garbarino, Julie LaFave, Julia Mata, David McDowell, Sigmund Popko, Andrew Russell, Aryeh Schwartz** and **Ashley Villaverde Halvorson** was adopted as the final nomination list for submission to Governor Ducey.

Justice Bolick thank the Commission members for their service.

### **Adjournment**

A motion to adjourn was made at 5:50 p.m. The motion was seconded and passed unanimously.